Investigating Two Crucifixion of Christ Paintings in Advanced Renaissance by Raphael and Grünewald

Alireza Akrami Hassankiadeh
Department of Painting,
Faculty of Art and Architecture,
University of Guilan,
Rasht, Iran.
Email: alireza_akrami12@yahoo.com

Abstract
Renaissance, or rebirth\(^1\) in West civilization refers to the period that is the initiator of the scientific revolution, religious reform and consequently progress in the arts. Crucifixion was one form of execution punishment that was prevalent in the dominance period of the Roman Empire on Palestinian and Judea regions among the Jews. The death of Christ on the top of cross is an event that has been repeated in Christian works, and the authors of each four Gospels (Matthew, Mark, Luke, John) have described it. This paper compared two paintings of the Christ crucifixion that were painted by two contemporary artists by the names of Raphael as the representative of the Italian Renaissance and Matthias Grünewald from the art of Northern Europe. In Raphael painting, representation of exalted beauty and grace of idealism derived from thinking of progressive Renaissance clearly be observed and against him, Grünewald although was well acquainted with the achievements of Renaissance art, but knowingly returned to the same principles of medieval painters and in showing of crucifixion as the preacher in condolence of Jesus, has not spared no effort to visualize a scene of terrible and painful Christ's crucifixion. The present study was investigated these two different approaches in the paintings from the crucifixion subject in a historical period and their structural and content differences was examined.

Keywords: Catholic, Grünewald, Jesus (AS), Renaissance, Protestant, Raphael.

Introduction
The term of Renaissance, or rebirth in West civilization refers to the period that is the initiator of the scientific revolution, religious reform and consequently progress in the arts. Usually renaissance or revival of Europe refers to a period of time that began from the conquest of Constantinople by the Ottoman Turks in 1453 and ended by the death of famous British Queen Elizabeth in 1603 (Dark, 1994, P. 2). Renaissance established the foundations of economic, political, artistic and scientific civilizations of the West today.

\(^1\) The renaissance term or rebirth was used first time by Giorgio Vasari that was Italian writer, painter, historian and architect.
Three intellectual revolutions of Copernicus\(^2\), Galilei\(^3\) and Descartes\(^4\) took place in the Renaissance. These three raised the growth of critical and doubts theory in the sincerity of the church and decreased its medieval power. Development of science and experience was undoubtedly due to the development of the printing industry in this period. Nationalism, geographical discoveries, urban population growth, the influence of Islamic cultures and the Byzantine (Eastern Roman), the revitalization of the non-Christian classical literature, university extension, along with the development of scientific research were other factors of Renaissance appearance. Continuance of gradual deviation from the heavenly values of medieval Catholic Church eventually led to the reformation or religious reform movement (Protestant\(^5\) Movement) in northern Europe. The tendency to humanism was developed. Human issues were considered more than anything instead of pious and God. Humanism soared in Italy, and humanists were critical to the church\(^6\). In fact, Renaissance was work of thinkers of Greece and ancient Rome studies that had an impact on architecture, painting, sculpture and other arts. In the field of painting, look to be more realistic than in the past and artists focused on religious issues less than the past. In the history of art, usually, the Renaissance divided to the stages include early (approximately 1300 - 1420), former (approximately 1420-1500) and late or advanced (approximately 1500 - 1527) (Pakbaz, 2002, p. 261). The climax of the Renaissance was in the sixteenth century. Progressive Renaissance not only brought a large group of exceptional geniuses but also found the logical foundation of praising from the artist-genius in the divine inspiration. Neoplatonists found Plato's famous praising from the poet in his Ion book:” All good poets intone their beautiful poems not only by help of art but also because they intone that have inspired and fascinated… because poet intone not only by help of art but also by help of Divine Powers " . And what poet could claim, artist of Renaissance also claimed and reached the visual art to a basis that was previously available only in poetry. Thus, the artist obtained its competent authorities on the eve of the beginning of the modern world history, and triumphantly claimed a sublime dignity among the "beautiful" arts for his work" (Gardner, 1995, p. 416). So, the Renaissance society praised the artist as sublime human and possessed of genius endowment.

From the most important achievements of the progressive Renaissance in the visual arts were included:

1. Invention of perspective by Brunelleschi\(^7\) to the scientific manner.
2. The study of the human body and human organs.
3. Inspired by the legacy left by Greek and ancient Roman art\(^8\).
4. Ordering the great art works by rulers.
6. Painting the non-religious scenes.
7. The replacement of oil paint with Tempera and also using the canvas fabric.

In any case, new art was emerged by Renaissance revolution that his work was invention of the truth in new period. God, world and new human was invented in art that was placed at other levels of the consciousness by heart, self-awareness and awareness means mysticism, philosophy and modern science belong to perception and discussion of thinkers (Madadpour, 1993. P. 211). Christian art resisted in front of naturalism until Renaissance and finally, fell into the trap of naturalism in that period. However, in the progressive Renaissance in contrast to the early Renaissance, idealistic and divine approach to religious figures and

\(^{2}\)Nicolaus Copernicus: February 19, 1473 – May 24, 1543, Polish astronomer, mathematician and economist.

\(^{3}\)Galileo Galilei: February 15, 1564 - January 8, 1642.

\(^{4}\)René Descartes: March 31, 1596 - February 11, 1650, French mathematician and philosopher.

\(^{5}\)Protestantism is one of the three main branches of Christianity is rooted in reformation of the sixteenth century and its followers do not follow the Roman Catholic Church or the Eastern Orthodox. The major difference between Protestants and Catholics can be found in three issues: a) the definition of faith, inner traits, religious beliefs and apparent religion and customs of religious.

\(^{6}\)Erasmus in his book "The Praise of Folly," which he wrote at the beginning of the sixteenth century, criticized the tyranny of the Christian authorities by humor and joke.

\(^{7}\)FilippoBrunelleschi: Italian architect (1377-1446).

\(^{8}\)Artists of this period inspired by Greek and Roman classical heritage looked to the world with a new vision. In the painting look was more realistic than the past.

\(^{9}\)Sfumato is a method for highlighting which as though, the objects are shown in the smoke or fog. Paintings and drawings of Leonardo da Vinci are clear example of the application of this method. (Pakbaz, 2002, p. 525).
saints in paintings was formed instead of pure realism in early Renaissance\(^{10}\). Christian art was a means for transferring and expression of religious teachings. Christian considered the painting as tools for expression and reflection the divine teachings and also representation of opinions and beliefs in down classes or masses of Christian faithful (Nasri, 2009. P. 66). Religious issues also considerable for the church and artist of Renaissance. In Christendom, other than the birth of Jesus (AS) that has a special dignity and must be consider separately, the last stage of the life of Christ is undoubtedly the most stressful part of his life which is very important especially for the history of art. Like other periods, Jesus (AS) on the cross is one of the main topics of the orderers and supporters in the church. Almost all prominent painters of this period have depicted at least one painting from the last stage of the life of Jesus Christ. Meanwhile, a fundamental change of attitude among Western and Northern Renaissance critics, who were representatives of the Catholic and Protestant Church respectively, has led to the creation of completely different works.

**Crucifixion**

Crucifixion was one form of execution punishment that was prevalent in the dominance period of the Roman Empire on Palestinian and Judea regions among the Jews\(^{11}\). The death of Christ on the top of cross is an event that has been repeated in Christian works and the authors of each four Gospels (Matthew, Mark, Luke, John) have described it\(^{12}\). Jesus (AS) himself had referred to his crucifixion before his death. "And when Jesus (AS) had finished all these sayings, he said to his disciples: You know that after two days is the Passover\(^{13}\) which the Son of Man be surrendered till be crucified"(the Gospel of Matthew, chapter twenty-six, verse 2). In Christian teachings, crucifixion of Christ is as an atonement for sins of human from its fundamental teachings and based on the New Testament Jesus Christ arose from among the dead on the third day after his death and ascended towards his father. If also had anticipated. "Destroy this temple, and in three days will raise it." (John II, verses 19, 21). The cross is the main symbol of Christianity. From the fourth century AD, when the Roman emperor "Constantine" transformed the Christianity to the official religion of the Roman Empire in the year of 312 AD, Christ's crucifixion was as a central theme of Western painting until the next centuries. Constantine's decision based on the Christianity was as the official religion of Roman Empire, remained a profound effect in Christian art. Until then, groups of Christians were not allowed to run openly their religious festivals in public places and they would gather inevitably for worshiping secretly in homes of rich Christians (Janson, 1980, p. 168). After this time, art and artists were sponsored by the recognition of Christianity. Decorating the palaces were replaced by garnishing and building the basilica and then churches. The formation of thought and transformation of Christian art were guided by evangelical traditions. Architects, sculptors and painters, being at the service of the church, could analyze and transfer the teachings of the Church, and devote themselves to promote those teachings. In the meantime, the narratives such as Crucifixion of Christ and The Last Supper were considerable more than other topics, and art supported and providers order had always special attention to these two issues. Many painters throughout Europe considered the image of crucified Christ as a pattern for their work. However, the Catholic Church has benefited from art painting in the promotion and expand of their teachings for many years. During the Byzantine Empire, Christianity's religion penetrated and developed its sovereignty by crosses and icons and numerous curtains to near and far lands. Mass of Christian artists who still had no

---

\(^{10}\)David Summers wrote in the book Michelangelo and the language of art: The sixteenth-century Italian art space did not consider the imitation of nature as the pinnacle of artistic achievement and knew the innovation as its most important goal (Summers, 1981, p. 47).

\(^{11}\)In this type of executed, criminals were tied to the crosses with a height of 5-6 meters above the ground in public by rope and three big spikes in the hands and feet (two spikes in the wrists of two hands and a pike for both feet), then the cross was hoisted on ground firmly. Meanwhile the victim was released and finally, died because of severe bleeding, hunger and thirst, invasion the birds and other factors. Then the executioners broke the legs of body with equipment and separated the body from the cross and brought it down.

\(^{12}\)The four Gospels have reported the life of Christ with slight differences, three Gospels "Matthew, Mark, Luke" are as biography and present more objective perceptions from the Jesus of Nazareth life but the Gospel of John report the more poetic interpretation.

\(^{13}\)Passover is a feast commemorating for the Exodus of The Israelites from Egypt in the Jewish, and Remembrance Day of Jesus Christ ascent in the Nazarenes, the Easter (Amid, 2003, P. 918).
name and address produced religious narrations initially as the arrays and Church ornaments and then as the independent works. The foremost, their work had religious value and religious role. Looking to developments that occurred in the first millennium of Christian and with the decisive defeat of iconoclasm in the tenth and eleventh century AD, gradually, the crucified individual became more important than the cross, and interest to image of "Son of God" increased especially in the western parts of the empire.

The Crucifixion by Raphael

Crucifixion painting (picture 1) was painted by Raphael (1483-1520) in 1503. The painting was prepared for the altar of Citta di Castello. The painting is known sometimes as Mond crucifixion - the person who gave this painting to the National Gallery- or sometimes is known as family that ordered it to painter hence Gavari Altarpiece (James, 1994, P. 67). Order the painting must have been a challenge for the young painters because it had allowed him to show his abilities on a large scale as well. Raphael indicated the closer connection with drawing way of Perugino (1445-1523) in this work.


In Christianity, iconoclasm has arisen due to the literal interpretation of the Ten Commandments. If the Exodus, Chapter 20 is stated: Do not get idol for own, whether in the form of anything in above heaven or on the below the earth or in the waters under the earth.

RaffaelloSanzio, Italian painter and architect, the youngest master of creator the Renaissance, Thereby, he reached to the most refined form to express the classical thought of his period time. He is known as a perfect pattern of Classicism. All academics were his indisputable followers for four centuries (Pakbaz, 2002, p. 243).
The decides of the figures in the background of landscape with trees by detailed miniature and abundant polishing which is dedicated to the works of Perugino\(^{16}\) showed the impact of painter from the aging artist. In addition, he in the style of coloring although it was closing to the style of da Vinci, but again returns to color themes of Perugino because he preferred the light colors than dark colors. He had spent childhood as a student near the Perugino. Here, Christ on the cross among the observers of crucifixion scene, namely Mary Magdalene, Jerome, Mary, and John (advertiser of Christianity) has been painted. The mellifluous faces form of Mary Magdalene, Jerome, Mary, and John under the cross may be confused with language of his teacher Perugino. Face of the Saint Mary and Christ was not painted in this work as a typical person, but Raphael showed the decency, purity and chastity in picture of Saint Mary, and superiority and holiness in the face of Jesus Christ. No artist could compete with Raphael in representation of beauty almighty and dignity of idealism derived from progressive Renaissance thinking. Conversely, overly polished and elegant forms of the saints, Christ has stronger structure; which is close to the art idea of Luca Signorelli\(^{17}\). Here is that the Christ has the dignified state and painter has focus on it. Beautiful lines and dancing on top of the picture that includes the clothing ribbons of Angels, robe of Christ and hung strips from it and shadowy pictures of angels creates an emblazoned level for their part that has put in contrast with sculptural corpus. Perhaps the most remarkable visual aspect of this painting which Raphael finished it in twenty years was its prospects. Here, can be seen the affected by Perugino. That meandering river which is beyond the cross and the important central position is a possible referring to baptism, draws a perspective that appears slowly and through short and a large cliff and hills have been cut. Some dark trees under clear skies are soaring. Shape of foliage in farthest distance that created just by a few free kick of brush, have disappeared in the atmosphere. The impact of high distance by gradual lighting of penumbra on the side of the horizon, both in the sky and the landscape becomes further (James, 1994, P.69). On top and two mass of the white clouds, the moon and the sun have been painting together\(^{18}\). Moon and Sun curtains crucified Jesus (AS) are symbol of the two natures of Christ and reverence for nature from the joy of the world. Sun and moon are settlement of Michael and Gabriel, two archangels, respectively (Cooper, 2007, p. 135). Among them and at the top of the cross can be seen a summarized inscription consisting of four letters in Latin (I.N.R.I). that its translation into Persian is: Jesus of Nazareth, King of the Jews. John describes that this sentence was written in three languages during the crucifixion: Hebrew, Latin, and Greek. (Greek interpretation is read I.N.B.I.) At the foot of the cross, a line was written in silver letters in Latin (RAPHAEL/VRBIN/AS/.P.[INXIT]) meaning as follows: " painted by Raphael of Urbino\(^{19}\). If Christ on the cross was removed from the painting, we could hardly believe that it is the scene of the crucifixion. Crown of thorns that the Jews put the head of Christ to ridicule and spikes mired in the arms and legs is not seen no sign of physical pain on the prophet of God (Picture 2).

---

\(^{16}\)Pietro Perugino

\(^{17}\)Luca Signorelli: Italian painter, 1441-1523. He was the pioneer of the representation of actionexplanatory in the bodyand belonged to the doctrine of Umbria and Florence. Interest of Signorelli to the exhibitive action of visual resolutions is clear in all religious compositionsand his single faces (Pakbaz, 2002, pp. 322 and 333).

\(^{18}\)In opinion of Rene Guenon "if the Cross built between the moon and sun, it will be truly centered universe." (Guenon, 1995, p. 66).

\(^{19}\)Urbino is the birthplace of Raphael.
it seems that he is mired in a trance sweets. Christ is draw free from suffering, pain and physical exhaustion. Symmetry and general relaxation in designing and coloring the elements of picture was diminished the excitement of this work each of them for its part. Ritual nature of picture is to the extent that in the group his followers, there was no particular turmoil and emotional sense. In collection of bodies, heavenly silence is seen like the silence that is governed in two angels beside Christ. Raphael in a theatrical combination attract the viewer's eye on to the deceased body of Christ by artistically using a circular motion and application of the appropriate color. Eye-catching composition of this painting follow the circular shape that was calculated part of the ideal show and the balance in Italian Renaissance is at the peak. Raphael worked such tirelessly and by the spirit of classical art that can almost be considered his art as the resurrection of Greek art at the peak of its development. Goethe, German poet and critic has said about Raphael: he did not have to imitate the Greeks because he thought and felt like Greeks (Gardner, 1995, p. 426).

The Crucifixion by Grünewald

During the fifteenth century, German painting art, common in affluent cities of Southern Germany had evolved along with expressionism and was influenced by the art of Flanders. At the end of fifteenth century and the beginning of sixteenth century, this art suddenly bloomed and flowered (Gardner, 1995, p. 481). Germany in the sixteenth century, under the influence of the Italian Renaissance and eagerness to attract the progress derived from the renaissance by gap of about a hundred years was entered. Mathis and his surname as Gothart or Neithardt known as Matthias Grünewald (approximately 1480-1528), painter, planner, hydraulic engineering and architecture, did not have interest to build a large and ideal body in a manner of Italian artists (like his contemporary young artist, Raphael). As well as, his interest in painting by religious subjects that was far from the common tendencies in Western Europe. Grünewald was including Northern artists who also had Lutheran inclinations. He "participated in a peasant revolt in 1525 AD and after the defeat of the rebellion was forced to escape to northern Germany and live in the of Anhalt city from the Saxony lands. The source of formation the Grünewald style is not precisely known. Probably he had traveled to Italy but cannot see trace of classicism of Renaissance in his art. With works by Dürer (Albrecht Dürer) was familiar and probably also became familiar with the works of Hieronymus Bosch (Gardner, 1995, p. 482).Janson putsIssenheim Altarpiece (picture 3) made by Grünewaldin North art in front of the great

---

20Martin Luther: (1483 - 1546) modern priest and translator of the Bible into German and a religious revisionism. He was the leader of the Protestant Reformation movement. The main elements of Luther's theology is: "Only Christ, belief, forgiveness, the Bible".

21After the death of Grünewaldwas found some documents among his papers that showed his predisposition to religious reform movement.
artistic phenomenon like Sistine. Mentioned Altarpiece was painted between years 1509-10 to 1515 for the church altar of monastery of monks for sect of Saint Antony in Alsace Issenheim that now, it is located in the museum of Colmar which is its nearby town. The altarpiece has two sets of wings that altogether four scenes was painted on the back and on it. Mentioned altarpiece in the closed position of two wings, appear the scene of Jesus on the cross (Janson, 1980, P. 386).

Picture 3. The Crucifixion, approximately 1520-1515. drawing on the blackboard with 302 × 265 cm, Unterlinden Museum, Colmar

In this dry and painful painting from the crucifixion of Christ, there is no sign of beauty such a way that is embodied in the works of Italian artists. According to the historical data that convicts were executed as undressed, here, Christ is naked. Grünewald as the preacher in condolence of Jesus (AS), has not spared no effort to visualize a scene of terrible and painful Christ's crucifixion: The moribund body of Christ has been hunch and convex under torture of the cross. Wounds caused by thorns of scourges was covered all his frail body. Black blood against the pale skin of wounded body stare the eye of the beholder. Compassionate of Jesus son of Mary by injured head and facial and poignant state of his hands speaks about the greatness of their sufferings. The suffering of Jesus in Mary's in the traditional group (consisting of the Virgin Mary, St. John the Gospel writer, and Mary Magdalene) was reflected. Mary in the cover of unmarried woman, in a state of fainting is located in the arms of St. John, the Gospel writer, who has been appointed by God to take care of her. Mary Magdalene by a smaller size kneels on the side of her salve and has curled her hands with grief. On the other side of the cross, we can see the powerful body of St. John the Baptist that symbol of him is a lamb which carries a small cross and pours his blood in communion wine cup (Picture 4).
He refers to the Christ by serious and authoritative manner and the top of his hand is written the words that speak about it. (According to the Gospel of John, chapter two, verse 30): "$\text{He must increase, but I accept reduction (Gombrich, 2000, p. 343).}$ Lamb is also a symbol of the crucified Jesus. The lamb of Christ were showed as both laboring and victorious and both suffering and resurrection. The Lamb with a cross is symbol of the crucified Jesus. John the Baptist with the lamb represents the voice that gives glad tidings of the coming of Christ (Cooper, 2007, p. 56).

Three people as historical evidence left on the death of Jesus moan as the individual while John the Baptist on the right side by the reassuring calm introduces him as the savior of humanity. Even the background also confirms this dichotomy, this means that the place of crucifixion is not the hill that is located in the city of Jerusalem but is the high mountain overlooking the lower peaks. As a result Jesus on the cross, which is isolated from the its normal place and has become as obsolete and isolated event that its picture is reflected such as shadow over the eerie and desolate landscape and the sky in blue black (Janson, 1980, P. 387).

Grunwald landscape in one of the terrible history of painting, is perhaps a metaphor for the cruelty that humans can inflict upon themselves. According to the beliefs of Protestant followers only mediator between God and man is Jesus Christ who was human and God at the same time (The divine and the temporal\textsuperscript{22}) and was crucified for the sins of mankind. It is as if Christ is not convinced to his numinous position in this painting, but his love for people was proven by sacrificing his life. From this perspective, Christ was promoted to a higher and more palpable status, a mediator who was destined to link the wickedness and darkness of the earth with the purity and clarity of the sky. Christ's message is a message for the beginning and end of time. From the perspective of Christian religion, Jesus has been appear to save humanity. But as in the Gospel of John is written in the first chapter, "$\text{Light shines in the darkness and darkness did not find it".}$ Intuitive emphasize of this painting is on the grief that is dispersed in the context of the event, and suffering and crucifixion and loneliness of helpers who lost their divine leader and mourn on his dead body.

The skin of Christ as a result of torture and flogging is swollen and torn. Since he has worked this painting for hospital, Observations from patients who suffer of the skin diseases had a big help to draw up the Body of Christ. Sorrowful aspect of this painting can be attributed partly due to the establishment of him at the hospital because they wanted to tell patients by this work that other human tolerated the pain and suffering

\textsuperscript{22}Two lines that make up the dimensional cross the code of two natures of divine and the temporal of Jesus.
more than them. Jesus on the cross was one of the four simulated copy of this event that some of them had been located the same places. However, only the firing imagination power of Grünewald could create such a terrifying image and tragic from the suffering of Jesus. Injured body, bloody and lifeless of Jesus on the grounds of darkness and dimness that in accordance the text of the Bible which was dominated on the surface of the earth are twisted by muscles and limbs together and embodied numerous wounds and tears. At the moment of death, the punishment higher than endure of person twisted bruised legs, split under his arm, hangs the head toward the one side and distort the fingers. To realize the stiffness and elongation of nerves and showing every lines of Jesus body on the cross, is sufficient try to change my fingers to his toes (Gardner, 1995, p. 483). Hand is stretched abnormal state and in a state of tearing. Hands has been surrendered to Almighty God in a state as physical screaming and hopelessly (Picture 5).

Picture 5
Foremost, here he is a real suffered person with body covered by wounds and sad faces as if has been old an overnight. Gardner believed that "no other artist has been able to depict such picture from ugliness of human suffering. (I.N.R.I)\textsuperscript{23} can be seen on the cross. Cross bar is bent under the weight of dying Christ. In this painting he has tried to express both human and divine character in the body of Christ and to achieve this purpose, it has borrowed many elements from the Middle Ages\textsuperscript{24}. This painting maintained many aspects of its spiritual and the divine and is the narrator of a doctrine of God.

Conclusion
Although Grünewald was well acquainted with the achievements of Renaissance art, he never sacrificed his personal style of expression to use it. He had truly the spirit of individuality seen among the Renaissance artists; with a courage rarely seen in the history of art which could only result from the painter's belief in his talent. Grünewald was undoubtedly a great artist and pure genius. His importance to his personal expression has shown understanding of individualism obtained from Renaissance opinions. The painting is considered as complete break from the tradition of crucifixion painting in Renaissance of West Europe. He consciously returned to the same principles of medieval painters and prove of this claim be determined in comparing the size of unreal individuals based on their importance. His unique painting points out deep religious beliefs of

\textsuperscript{23}Look at Gardner, 1995, p. 483.
\textsuperscript{24}Lutheran Church in Doctrine "Atonement of human sins through visualization, torture and death of Christ" have borrowed his theological idea from the Church of the Middle Ages and particularly in teaching objective of this doctrine follows the tradition of St. Anselm's. Anyway this church has created little change in the doctrine of St. Anselm and the torture of Christ's is considered as not willingly and voluntarily, but is accepted as punishment behalf of us. (Molland, 1989, p. 199).
an artist with a vision beyond the visible world by his inner wonderful expressive power. In this way of making the illustration, work enters from religious rank to emotional rank and timeless spaces of Chris crucifixion converts to the timely and tangible scene. In picture of Grunwald, Christ doesn’t have static and cool look but his suffering head and body quite reflect the feeling and mode. In return, crucified Jesus in the Raphael painting is portrayed impassive and superior of temporal effects pest. Suffering and pain was not felt in his face. In fact, Raphael wanted to bring out the event which is inherently timeless from captivity of temporality. In his work is governed the ritual spirit. Although there are a lot of emphasis on the aspects of physical proportions, however, ideal aspect overcome on the emotional and material aspects.

References


